THE APPOINTMENT OF NON-MUSLIM LEADERS  
(Study of Surah Al-Mâ’idah verses 51 and 57 Using Semantic Approach)  

Umum B. Karyanto  
IAIN Pekalongan  
umumbudi@ymail.com

Abstract:  
It is a common thing that there is a controversy over non-muslim leadership in the majority of muslims. Historically, this issue has been long-standing and has always been debatable among experts from time to time. As the result of this issue, Ulamas are divided into two groups, one of them is forbid the non-muslim issue, but others permit. Indonesia, which has muslim as the most population often experience a collision related to the appointment of non-muslim leaders. Essentially, leadership is a mandate that must be mandated to those who can afford it. Indonesian law guarantees all its citizens to emerge as both muslim and non-muslim leaders. Therefore, this paper attempts to analyze the appointment of non-Muslim leaders with a semantic approach according to verses of the Qur’ân that textually prohibit muslims (believers) to appoint non-muslims as leaders. It is because of the words waliy and auliyâ’ which textually have the meaning as “protector and leader”. This paper used semantic approach refers to the basic and relational meaning to make it fairer in interpreting the text.

Keywords: non-muslim, waliy, auliyâ’, semantic, Al-Qur’ân.
family life, economy, and politics. The rules of Islam in general can be grouped into two, namely the rule of law on human relations with God (hablun minallâh) and the rule of law on human relations with God’s fellows (hablun minannâs). The first type of the relationship is called worship (ibâdah), while the second type is called mu’âmalah. This brief study will discuss one part of the second type of the relationship pattern, namely mu’âmalah, especially about the pattern of relationships in the life of the state (politics).

Leadership is a multidisciplinary field concerned as well with ethics and morality. However, leadership is conceived differently in the West and the Islamic view. This difference is largely attributed to the differences in culture and their respective world views.

In Islamic concepts (manhaj), leaders are final and fundamental. He occupies the highest position in Islamic society. For Islamic fellow, the leader is like the head of all his limbs. He has a strategic role in pattern setting (minhaj) and movement (harakah). His skill in leading will lead his people to achieve their goals, namely the glory and prosperity with the accompaniment of Allah Swt.

One of the problems that arises in the matter of leadership is the question of non-Muslim leaders. The question is whether non-Muslims can be leaders in Muslim-majority areas? The high level of religious plurality in Indonesia allows the government led by someone who has a belief of minor belief. This question is considered as a kind of contextual one, especially in Indonesia. The fact can be seen on the phenomenon of Basuki Tjahaya Purnama or Ahok, as a non-Muslim candidate who won DKI Jakarta election as a governor in 2017. Because of nominating of Basuki Tjahaya Purnama, called Ahok, the discussion of non-Muslim leaders is very influential and contextual to be discussed, especially according to Qur’an.

**Semantics and the Language Meaning**

Semantics is the systematic study of meaning, and linguistic semantics is the study of how languages organize and express meanings.¹ Semantics (as the study of meaning) is central to the study of communication; and as communication becomes more and more pressing. Semantics is also at the centre of the study of human mind—thought processes, cognition, conceptualization—all these are intricately bound up with the way in which we classify and convey our experience of the word through language.²

Semantics is part of the language structure that is related to the meaning of expression and structure of the meaning of a speech. Meaning is the purpose of speech, the

---

influence of the language unit in understanding the perception, as well as human or group behavior. The meaning of the word is the field of study discussed in semantics. Various types of word meaning are examined in semantic science. The connotative meaning is one of the types of meaning discussed in the semantic study, which means that the meaning is not true. It is stated in a clause.

Etymologically, semantics means the study of word meaning (knowledge of the intricacy and shifting of the words meaning). According to Izutsu, semantics is a study that deals with phenomena of meaning in the broader sense of the word. It is based on belief that almost anything might be considered to have meaning, and it is the objective of semantic study. The word semantics is actually a technical term that refers to the study of the language meaning.

The meaning of the language varies according to the context of its use in the sentence. In semantic analysis, it must be realized that the language is unique and has a close relationship with cultural issues. Therefore, a language analysis only applies to that language and cannot be used to analyze other languages. For example, the word fish in Indonesian refers to the type of animal that lives in water and is usually eaten as a side dish. In English, the word is called fish. But the word “iwak” in Javanese does not only mean fish (ikan) or fish, but also meat used as a side dish.

According to Verhaar, semantics is a systematic branch of language that investigates the meaning. Another opinion stated by Abdul Chaer, who claimed that in semantics, there is discussion of the relationship between words with the concept or meaning of the words, as well as objects or things have the meaning that is outside the language. The meaning of a word, phrase or discourse is determined by the context.

According to Tarigan, semantics examines the symbols or signs that express the meaning, the relationship of meaning to one another, and its influence on humans and society. Thus, semantics is always related to the meaning used by its speakers. Based on some opinions above, it can be concluded that semantics is the study of the symbols or signs that express the meaning, the relationship of meaning to one another, and the relationship

---

3Harimurti Kridalaksana, Kamus Linguistik (Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2001), 193.

---

8Abdul Chaer, Pengantar Semantik Bahasa Indonesia (Jakarta: Rineka Cipta, 2009), 60.
The Appointment of Non-Muslim Leaders

between words according to the concept or meaning of the word.  

According to Toshiko Izutsu, semantics is an analytic study of the key terms for a language with a view that comes to conceptual understanding for weltanschauung (worldview) of people who use the language, not only as a tool of speech and thinking, but also the conceptualization and interpretation of the world that surrounds it. Toshihiko argues that a language can not simply be moved into another one without the intervention of a "concept error".  

According to Nurhayati, word meaning is a field of study discussed in semantic science. Semantics is a branch of linguistics that studies the meaning of a word in language, while linguistics is the study of spoken and written language that has systematic, rational, and empirical features as a description of the structure and rules of the language. Based on the opinion above, it can be concluded that the meaning of a word in the language can be known by implementing semantic study. In Kamus Bahasa Indonesia (KBI), the word “makna” means the meaning or meaning of word; bermakna berarti; mempunyai (mengandung) arti: kalimat itu ~ 

The Translation of the Qur’aan

Translation is expressing what written in one language (SL) into another language (TL), so, actually it is expressing one thought or more by words. Translation is a communication or, more precisely, a form of cross-cultural communication. Translation is the act of translating. To translate means to change from one language to another, to interpret, to transfer, and to change. Translation is the act of rendering what expressed in one language by means of another language.  

On the other hand, Nida and Taber state that “translating consists in reproducing in the receptor language the closest natural equivalent of the source language message”.  

---

11Endang Nurhayati, Sosiolinguistik Kajian Kode Tutur dalam Wayang Kulit (Yogyakarta: Kanwa Publisher, 2009), 3.
12Dendy Sugono, Kamus Bahasa Indonesia (Jakarta: Pusat Bahasa Departemen Pendidikan Nasional, 2008), 903.
14Ibid.
This definition is more comprehensive than the previous ones. Nida and Taber explicitly state that translation is closely related to the problems of languages, meaning, and equivalence.\(^\text{16}\)

From the definitions mentioned above, it can be concluded that translation is a process which is intended to find meaning equivalence in the target text.

The term translation itself has several meanings: it can refer to the general subject field, the product (the text that has been translated) or the process (the act of producing the translation, otherwise known as translating). The process of translation between two different written languages involves the translator changing an original written text (the source text or ST) in the original verbal language (the source language or SL) into a written text (the target text or TT) in a different verbal language (the target language or TL).\(^\text{17}\)

The activity of translating the Qur'\(\text{\'an}\) is not new. The translation program of Al-Qur'\(\text{\'an}\) aims to facilitate the process of learning Qur'\(\text{\'an}\). This activity has been done since the beginning of the 2\(^{\text{nd}}\) century AD when Qur'\(\text{\'an}\) was translated into Latin by Robert of Ketton (Robert de Retines).\(^\text{18}\) Until now Qur'\(\text{\'an}\) has been translated into various languages, such as Persian, Turkish, Urdu, Indian, Japanese, English, French, Spanish, Mandarin, Indonesian and African countries.\(^\text{19}\)

Translation of Al-Qur'\(\text{\'an}\) from the past until now has become part of the history of the Muslim scientists. Currently one of the best means of tabl\(\text{\'}ig\) is translating Qur'\(\text{\'an}\) and introduce the essence and study of Qur'\(\text{\'an}\) following syarah and tafsir to the people of the world.

The holy Quran has been translated into many languages, since translation has a great role in spreading Islam all over the world. These translations have varied between free and literal translations. In the other way, questions raised about the acceptability of literal translation by Muslim scholars, especially about the fidelity to the original text. If we look at these glorious meanings with literal translation, it is obvious that there is a huge difference between both, the source text and the target text.

Translation Al-Qur'\(\text{\'an}\) defined as transferring and interpreting Qur'\(\text{\'an}\) from the source language, i.e. Arabic, into the target language. This process meansthat the translation and interpretation are printed into several manuscripts that can be read by a person who does not understand Arabic so he


\(^{17}\) Jeremy Munday, *Introducing Translation*, 5


can understand the purpose of the book of Allah with this intermediate translator.\textsuperscript{20} Translating activity, especially Qur’ān into the Foreign language, is an activity that requires high caution so that people who are interested in translating Qur’ān must have detailed knowledge of Arabic, master the target language completed with good word-writing techniques and has the criteria as a mufassir/interpreter. Therefore, translating Qur’ān is not an easy work for anyone, except those who are interested and talented to be an interpreter.

It is of course true that studying the Qur’an as a source for the life and thought of Muhammad. In the nineteenth century, this shift was intimately linked to the question of how Muhammad was to be evaluated as a person. The emphasis that Qur’anic Studies places on viewing the Qur’ānas part and parcel of the wide expanse of monotheistic literature can be seen as a corrective shift that was long overdue.

Muslims always define translation as a way to understand the meaning of Qur’ān. All Arabian and Arabian Muslims intentionally obtain satisfaction and blessings of the pronunciation of the sacred words. The words are what the Prophet said, and read by his friends as well as the next generation of Muslims in different lands and throughout the Islamic era.\textsuperscript{21}

**Semantic Studies of Qur’ānic verses about Non-Muslim Leadership**

The leadership in Islam is a trust and isrooted in the Qur’ān, literally the word of God and the Sunnah, sayings and doings of Prophet Muhammad. The leadership values emphasized in Islam can be expressed in one word, tawhid. A leader who subscribes to tawhid means that he/she truly believes in the unity and sovereignty of God. So aligned, the leaders will always be mindful of vertical accountability to God and horizontal accountability to fellow beings for all deeds and actions.

So attuned, the leaders will always seek to enjoin good and forbid evil. The leader will be guided by the shari’ah and will take decision on the basis of mutual consultation (shura) thus creating a high level of trust and support among the followers needed to enhance their commitment to the cause of pleasing Allah and serving the humanity. Leadership requires a leader to guide, protect and treat the followers fairly with justice (‘adl).

Leadership from Western Perspective defined as "a particular type of power relationship". Considering that leadership and politics (defined as power) are inextricably

---


linked. It insists that an understanding of "the nature of leadership requires understanding of the essence of power, for leadership is a special form of power".22

Power in its various forms (coercive, legitimate, reward and expert or Weberian traditional, bureaucratic and charismatic power) is present to some degree in any leader-follower relationship. Power, however, is the ever-present inescapable common feature of Western and other secular political systems and has been criticized by the Western scholars themselves.

Regardless of the pros and cons, there are at least four verses of Qur’an that are tell about non-Muslim leaders. From some verses of Qur’an, it can be explained that a Muslim must choose a Muslim leader. The verses that tell about leaders, are 1. Al-Qur’an surah Al-Imrân [3]: 28; 2. Al-Qur’an surah Al-Mâ’idah [5]: 51; 3. Al-Qur’an surah Al-Mâ’idah [5]: 57; 4. Al-Qur’an surah An-Nisâ [4]: 144, and 5. At-Taubah [9]: 12. In Al-Qur’an surah Al-Mâ’idah [5]: 51, Allah asserts:

O you who believe! take not the Jews and Christians as Auliyâ’ (friends, protector, helpers), they are but Auliyâ’ of each other. And if any amongst you takes them ( as Auliyâ’) then surely he is one of them. Verily, Allâh guides not those people who are the Zâlimûn (polytheist and wrong-doers and unjust).

The above verse seems to invite Muslims to be "fanatical". Why does Qur’an affirm this? Is there any tolerance for choosing non-Muslim leaders? In Qur’an and its translation by the team of Ministry of Religious Affairs, the word auliya’s translated with the leaders. The word auliya is also contained in surah ‘Ali Imrân verse 28, surah An-Nisâ verse 144, and surah Al-Mâ’idah verses 51 and 57. The word auliya is a plural (plural) form of waliy (ولی), which originally has lexical meaning as "close". Then from the original meaning, there are some derivatives meanings arisen, such as walâ-yalî which means close to and follow. Wallâ (وَلَّى) which means to master, help, and love. Aulâ (أولى) which means to authorize, entrust and do. Tawallâ (تولى) means fulfilling, treating, taking care, and mastering. All derivative words of waliy refer to the meaning of proximity, except when accompanied by the word ‘an explicitly and implicitly as in the wallâ’ ‘an and ‘tawallâ’ ‘an, then its intended meaning is to stay away or turn away. Therefore, the word”wali” thus has many meanings, i.e. close ones, friends, helpers, guardians, allies, followers, protectors, guards, leaders, the loving, the beloved, and the ruler all bound by the proximity of the red thread.23

Like a father, he is the most important person to be the guardian (wali) of his

---


The Appointment of Non-Muslim Leaders
dughter because he is the closest to her. A person who is very obedient and devoted to worship is named “wali” because he is close to God. It is likewise the leader, because he should be close to the persons he leads. It is thus seen that all the meanings mentioned above can be covered by the word auliya. Therefore, this word of God shows that it is not permissible to make Jews and Christians as leaders. The word is a form of closeness to something that makes up and loses the boundary between the approaching and the approached in the purpose of that closeness. If the goal is in the context of piety and help, the word auliya means helpers, but in the context of association and compassion, the word auliya means the attraction of the soul, whereas in the context of obedience, the word wali means who rules and has to be obeyed.

In semantic study, it is necessary to distinguish between the basic and relational meaning. The basic meaning is something that is attached to the word itself, which is alwayscarried wherever it is put. For example, the term kafara, in pre-Islamic times this word precisely and fundamentally has the meaning "ungrateful" to others who provide help or have done good so that at this time the term kafara is exactly opposite to the word syakara. This is the prevalent meaning of the verbs kafara in the wider Arabic context. The basic meaning of this verb has not changed either by Muslim or non-Muslim Arabs. This word is known by all of the communities for Arabic native speakers. In addition, the basic meaning of this word has remained so from pre-Islamic times to the present day.

In the study of relational meaning, there is a shift of meaning in the verb of kafara or the noun kufr deviated slightly from its original meaning "not grateful", and becomes increasingly close to the meaning of "unbelief" as a form of denial of the concept of faith. Thus, Al-Qur’an by bringing relational meaning, without eliminating the basic meaning that was understood before by fighting with faith (belief) and Islam (surrender), in Qur’ânis still found the meaning kufrikafara both are in basic and relational meaning.

Semantically, the term kufr has a strong connection with other terms in Qur’ân containing bad ethics. The terms that are directly and explicitly contain the meaning of kufr in itself, besides the term kufr itself, are juhud, ilhad, inkar, and syirk. While other terms that implicitly imply and contain the meaning of infidelity are fisq (fusūq), zulm, fujūr, jurm (ijrām), dalāl and ghayy, fasād, i’tidā, isrāf, isyâן, kidhb (takabbur, istikbâr), kidhb (takhdîb) and ghaflât. These terms when appear in the form of ism al-fā’il (active

---

25 Ibid., 151.
26 Toshihiko Izutsu, Etika Beragama, 12–14.
27 Ibid., 15.
participant, perpetrator), generally refer to unbelievers. It proves that *kufr* is a dimensionless term which can be seen from various aspects of meaning, and at the same time occupies a central position of all malicious ethics in *Qur'ān*.28

**The Ulama’s View of Non-Muslim Leaders**

Associated with non-Muslim leaders, there are some interpretations of some ulama, which stated as follows.

1. Sheikh Imām Qurṭubi

   He argued that the leader must be held by Muslim and it is very dangerous if the leader is occupied by non-Muslim. In his book *Tafsīr al-Qurṭubi*, he declared, in this day and age the situation has been reversed and changed in such a way that many Muslims entrust everything to the disbelievers much more.29

2. Hasbi ash-Siddiqy

   He stated that cooperation, mutual aid, and loyal friendship between two people of different religions for the benefit of the world is not prohibited as his statement in *Tafsîr Fî-Zhilālil-Qur'ân*, he assumed that Islam demand fellows to tolerate and engage in good relations with the Kitabist, especially those who say: "*We are indeed Christians."

   However, *Al-Qur'ān* forbides them to give loyalty to them because of tolerance and join together as far as a matter of morals and behavior. On the other hand, the problem of *wala* (loyalty) is a matter of faith and the problem of arranging people.31

4. Ahmad Mustafâ al-Marâgi

   He argued that the appointment of non-Muslim officials is not a problem, indeed many verses of *Qur'an* strictly prohibit Muslims from appointing non-Muslims to be their protectors, but there are reasons to forbid them.

   In general the prohibition is about taking non-Muslims as friends in any way that endanger themselves, such as unlocking special cases relating to religious affairs, conspiring to fight against other Muslims.32

Furthermore Al-Marâgi argued in his

---

The Appointment of Non-Muslim Leaders

commentary that employing dhimmykufr in Islamic government is not prohibited. All of Sahabat r.a. employed them in amiriyah offices.  

5. M. Quraish Shihab

He argued that non-Muslims who have bad character, criticized by Qur’an, are forbidden to appoint him as a state official.

On the contrary, non-Muslims who are not badly criticized by Qur’an, may be allowed to appoint him as one of the state officials. According to M. Quraish Shihab, leadership is an ability and readiness possessed by a person to be able to maintain, supervise and protect the people he leads. Leadership is a mandate that must be surrendered by those who can afford it.  

Thus, the appointment to carry out the mandate must be in accordance with his or her expertise so that the duty can be managed properly. The appointment of a person to carry out a position that is not correlated with his or her competence will adversely affect the government system itself. According to him, Qur’an gives guidance either explicitly or implicitly in various aspects of human life, including an effort to answer "who is appropriate to choose".

From the slit of the Quranic verses, there are at least two basic characters that must be carried by a person who endures a position relating to the people rights. Both of them should be taken into consideration in determining the choice. "Verily, the best of men for you to hire the strong, the trustworthy," said the daughter of the Prophet Syu'aib, which was justified and stated in Al-Qur'an surah Al-Qasas verse 26.

6. Wahbah al-Zuhaili

He stated that supporting non-Muslims as leaders demonstrates the impression Muslims perceiving both the paths of unbelief pursued by non-Muslims.

He said that blessing of disbelief of Muslims means they also have disbelieved. However, if there is cooperation with non-Muslims related to the world affairs without the blessing of their disbelief, then it is not prohibited. This prohibition related to the relationships and ties with non-Muslims in depth. Meanwhile, if the relationship is merely a normal interaction and trade without deep-rooted assimilation, it is not prohibited because the Prophet Muhammad SAW. also interacted with Jews and mortgaged an armour to him.  

7. Hamka

He confirmed the prohibition of choosing non-Muslim leaders issue. He warned everyone those who believe that they do not take the unbeliever to be wali. A person who does not believe in God can not

33Ibid., Jilid V, 319.
34M. Quraish Shihab, Tafsir Al-Misbah, 314.
35Wahbah al-Zuhaili, al-Tafsir al-Munir fi al-'Aqidah wa as-Syar'ah wa al-Manhaj, Cet. XXVIII (Beirut: Dar al-Fikr al-Mu'asir, t.th.), 199-200
be *waliy* as a leader or *waliy* as a friend. He said that the consequences will appear in the future because Muslims will be led by them (non-Muslim leaders) into the *ṭāğût*. If they made friends, Muslims would be invited to the perverted path by leading Muslims to do evil things and prevent doing good. This Hamka's opinion should be seen as the caution of Muslims, who are the majority of this country. This caution can be seen from his description, by the time interpreting the verses about the prohibition of non-Muslim leaders.

8. Ibn Taymiyya

Ibn Taymiyya gave a very brave statement: "It is better led by a just pagan leader, than led by an unjust Muslim leader". He stated that a person who can be appointed as a leader is a person who has the power and integrity, is able to do justice and have strong commitment to the prosperity of the people he leads regardless of his faith. Thus, the relevance of Ibn Taimiyah's thought in the case of non-Muslim choosing a leader among Muslims appears, which means that it is permissible as long as the leader fulfill the requirements. *First*, obtaining the support of the most Muslim is determined by consultation or discussion and *bai'at*. *Second*, gaining support from Ahl Asy-Syaukah or elements of stake holder in society. *Third*, having personal power and being trusted completed by honesty, trustful, and just so a leader will be able to provide good habits to other people. Ibn Taymiyyah's argued "God supports justice government eventhough it is kāfir, and does not support tyrannical rule eventhrough it is Muslims".

In Islam, the process of determining a leader who can lead people becomes an interesting discourse to discuss. One of the opinions is from Anis Malik Thoha, who said that in Islam, government or *khilâfah* includes religion and world leadership that replaces Prophet Muhammad saw., as stated by the Ulama. Therefore, in this case, the leadership should not replace the Prophet Muhammad saw., except a Muslim. The positions which do not related to religious understandings (besides army and judicial leaders) can be filled by non-Muslims who have the competencies. In fact, the fuqaha like Al-Mawardi claimed that *kafir dhimmi* are allowed to hold executive positions. For example, there were some Christians held ministerial positions in the Abbasid caliphate era, such as Nasr ibn Harun (369 AH) and Isa ibn Nasturus (380 AH).

---


The Appointment of Non-Muslim Leaders

Conclusion

Muslims who appoint non-Muslims to be leaders are legitimate or permissible as long as they are not harmful. Leadership is an ability and readiness possessed by a person to be able to maintain, supervise and protect the people he leads. It is a trust that must be put on the people who are able to carry it out. In terms of contextuality, the law in Indonesia stated it is not prohibited rising non-Muslim into one of the government officials. There is no statement of Indonesian Constitution that prohibits them (non-Muslims) to hold a position in government. Working with non-Muslims in the social life is not prohibited as long as it does not involve the ritual religious activities of a leader.

The author keep considering the opinions of Ulama who do not allow Muslims appoint non-Muslim leaders because it is based on their caution and concern if non-Muslims become heads of government. The author also does not agree with statement “as long as he is a Muslim, it is no problem although he is disreputable”. In Islam view, both candidates of leaders are equally bad (less) so the one that should be chosen is the most minimal shortcomings. The recent argumentis choosing the disreputable person to be a good one is easier than forcing a non-Muslim person to be a Muslim. The elected leader can not do what he wishes anymore longer. In carrying out his duties and obligations he is bound by the rules (act). If he still performs his bad habits and goes against the rules, he will be subjected sanctions, even punishment.

The final conclusion is if the prospective leader of the original Muslim is not good, he can be forced to follow the existing provisions to prevent him in acting arbitrarily because if he does that such attitude, he will be prosecuted. On the other hand, an appropriate non-Muslim leader candidate must have the distinction (goodness). However, the belief are contrary to Qur’an. Then, as Muslims, although it is difficult to prove that he will not have good attitude for the nation and country, but if we believe Allah and the Book of God, we must follow the provisions of Qur’an.

References

Al-Hilâfi, Muḥammad Taqiyyuddin and Muḥammad Muḥsin Khân. 1404 H. Al-Qur’ān al-Karîm wa Tarjamatu


Ibn Taimiyah, Imam. Tt. Majmū’ Fatāwā Li Ibnī Taimiyah. Jilid. XXVIII.


